

Melanie J. Vartabedian (SBN 278181)
vartabedianm@ballardspahr.com
Goldie Fields (SBN 351731)
fieldsg@ballardspahr.com
BALLARD SPAHR LLP
2029 Century Park East, Suite 1400
Los Angeles, CA 90067-2915
Telephone: 424.204.4400
Facsimile: 424.204.4350

*Attorneys for Defendant
Citibank, N.A.*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

ALEXANDER J. CARROLL, an
Individual,

Plaintiffs,

v.

CITIBANK, N.A. dba CITICARDS
CBNA a business entity, form unknown,
EXPERICAN INFORMATION
SOLUTIONS INC., is a business entity,
INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC, is a
business entity, form unknown,
TRANSUNION, LLC, a business entity,
form unknown and DOES 1-25,
Inclusive,

Defendants.

Case no. 2:23-CV-08787-ODW (PDx)

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER**

Honorable Otis D. Wright II

1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends

1 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
2 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth
3 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them
4 to file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
5 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a
6 party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

7 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

8 This action is likely to involve financial, technical and/or proprietary
9 information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for
10 any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential
11 and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things,
12 confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential
13 business practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial
14 information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties),
15 information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be
16 privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes,
17 court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of
18 information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of
19 discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to
20 keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses
21 of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their
22 handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order
23 for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that
24 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
25 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in
26 a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be
27 part of the public record of this case.
28

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: As captioned above: *Carroll v. Citibank et al.*, 2:23-CV-08787-ODW (PDX).

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action

1 and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law
2 firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

3 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
4 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
5 support staffs).

6 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
7 Discovery Material in this Action.

8 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
9 support services (e. g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits
10 or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or
11 medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

12 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
13 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

14 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
15 Material from a Producing Party.

16 3. SCOPE

17 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
18 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
19 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
20 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
21 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

22 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the
23 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

24 4. DURATION

25 Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations
26 imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees
27 otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be
28 deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action,

1 with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and
2 exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action,
3 including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of
4 time pursuant to applicable law.

5 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

6 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

7 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
8 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
9 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
10 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
11 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
12 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
13 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

14 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
15 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
16 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
17 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the
18 Designating Party to sanctions.

19 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
20 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
21 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

22 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
23 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
24 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
25 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
26 produced.

1 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

2 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
3 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
4 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
5 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that
6 contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
7 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the
8 protected portion(s) (e. g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

9 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
10 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
11 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
12 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
13 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the
14 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine
15 which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order.
16 Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix
17 the “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If
18 only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
19 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
20 appropriate markings in the margins).

21 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
22 identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
23 deposition all protected testimony.

24 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary
25 and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent
26 place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is
27 stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the
28

1 information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable,
2 shall identify the protected portion(s).

3 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
4 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
5 the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such
6 material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make
7 reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the
8 provisions of this Order.

9 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

10 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
11 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's
12 Scheduling Order.

13 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
14 resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

15 6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be
16 on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
17 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
18 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
19 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
20 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
21 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
22 challenge.

23 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

24 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
25 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
26 Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such
27 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under
28 the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a

1 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
2 DISPOSITION).

3 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
4 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
5 authorized under this Order.

6 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
7 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
8 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
9 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

10 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this Action,
11 as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
12 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

13 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House
14 Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for
15 this Action;

16 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to
17 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
18 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

19 (d) the court and its personnel;

20 (e) court reporters and their staff;

21 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
22 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action
23 and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound”
24 (Exhibit A);

25 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the
26 information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the
27 information;

28

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which

1 the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's
2 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
3 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
4 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
5 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

6 9. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
7 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

8 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced
9 by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such
10 information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected
11 by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions
12 should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional
13 protections.

14 (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery
15 request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and
16 the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-
17 Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:

18 (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the
19 Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a
20 confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

21 (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the
22 Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a
23 reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

24 (3) make the information requested available for inspection
25 by the Non-Party, if requested.

26 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court
27 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the
28 Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive

1 to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the
2 Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that
3 is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a
4 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party
5 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its
6 Protected Material.

7 10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

8 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has
9 disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized
10 under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a)
11 notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its
12 best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform
13 the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms
14 of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the
15 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as
16 Exhibit A.

17 11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
18 PROTECTED MATERIAL

19 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
20 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
21 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal
22 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify
23 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for
24 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
25 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure
26 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or
27 work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the
28 stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel

1 are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial,
2 deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition
3 and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert
4 work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival
5 copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this
6 Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

7 14. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
8 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
9 sanctions.

10 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.

11 DATED: June 26, 2024

12
13 /s/ Robert F. Brennan
14 Attorneys for Plaintiff

15 DATED: June 26, 2024

16
17 /s/ Melanie J. Vartabedian
Attorneys for Defendant

18 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

19
20 DATED: June 28, 2024

21
22 

23
24 Hon. Patricia Donahue
United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ **[print or type full name]**, of
 _____ **[print or type full address]**, declare under penalty of
 perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order
 that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of
 California on [date] in the case of _____ **[insert formal name of the case
 and the number and initials assigned to it by the court]**. I agree to comply with
 and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand
 and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and
 punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in
 any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order
 to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.
 I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
 Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated
 Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of
 this action. I hereby appoint _____ **[print or type full name]**
 of _____ **[print or type full address and telephone
 number]** as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action
 or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed:

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____

\\

\\

\\

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on this 26th day of June, 2024, I electronically filed a true and correct copy of the foregoing through the Court's CM/ECF system, which will send a notice of electronic filing to the following:

/s/ Melanie J. Vartabedian
Melanie J. Vartabedian

Ballard Spahr LLP
2029 Century Park East, Suite 1400
Los Angeles, California 90067-2915